



Twinning Light Fiche

Project title: The Art of Organoleptic Checks of Fish and Other Food of Animal Origin: Guidelines, Practice and Challenges

Beneficiary administration: The Veterinary Department of the National Food Services, Ministry of Health, Israel

Twinning Reference: IL 18 ENI HE 01 22 TWL

Publication notice reference: EuropeAid/174726/DD/ACT/IL

EU funded project

TWINNING TOOL

1. Basic Information

For UK applicants: Please be aware that following the entry into force of the EU-UK Withdrawal Agreement¹ on 1 February 2020 and in particular Articles 127(6), 137 and 138, the references to natural or legal persons residing or established in a Member State of the European Union and to goods originating from an eligible country, as defined under Regulation (EU) No 236/2014² and Annex IV of the ACP-EU Partnership Agreement³, are to be understood as including natural or legal persons residing or established in, and to goods originating from, the United Kingdom⁴. Those persons and goods are therefore eligible under this call.

All cooperation is subject to the requirements set out in the "Guidelines on the eligibility of Israeli entities and their activities in the territories occupied by Israel since June 1967 for grants, prizes and financial instruments funded by the EU from 2014 onwards", publication reference 2013/C-205/05, published on the OJEU C-205 dated 19.07.2013.

1.1 Programme

ENI/2018/041-315 - "Support to ENP Action Plan 2018 Israel" – Direct Management

The European Neighbourhood Programme (ENP) applies to Israel although the country receives limited bilateral funding from the EU, as it is a member of the OECD. There is no Single Support Framework for Israel. While formal decision on the identification and adoption of new EU-Israel Partnership Priorities (PPs) in line with the revised European Neighbourhood Policy is pending, the EU-Israel ENP Action Plan has been extended until January 2025 and constitutes the basis of the EU-Israel cooperation.

No Association Committee or Association Council meetings were held since 2012, however cooperation actions and policy dialogue in several areas continued actively throughout.

The Israeli economy has showed strong resilience during the global economic downturn of last decade and has maintained high Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth rates. Like many other countries, the Corona crisis has affected also Israel, but since it reached the crisis in a relatively strong and stable economic situation, after a 2.2% GDP decrease in 2020, its GDP has increased in 2021 by 8.1%, higher than the OECD level of 2.1% growth⁵.

The EU is, and for the near future will remain, Israel's largest trading partner, currently representing 30% of Israel's total trade. Institutional Twinning and Technical Assistance and Information Exchange Instrument (TAIEX) are the modalities used in bilateral co-operation with Israel. Israel made use of TAIEX and Twinning instruments to increase legislative approximation in areas such as market regulation, statistics, agriculture policy, welfare services and, most recently, environment. All cooperation is subject to the requirements set out in the "Guidelines on the eligibility of Israeli entities and their activities in the territories occupied by Israel since June 1967 for grants, prizes and financial instruments funded by the EU from 2014 onwards".

¹ Agreement on the withdrawal of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland from the European Union and the European Atomic Energy Community.

² Regulation (EU) No 236/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 11 March 2014 laying down common rules and procedures for the implementation of the Union's instruments for financing external action.

³ Annex IV to the ACP-EU Partnership Agreement, as revised by Decision 1/2014 of the ACP-EU Council of Ministers (OJ L196/40, 3.7.2014).

⁴ Including the Overseas Countries and Territories having special relations with the United Kingdom, as laid down in Part Four and Annex II of the TFEU.

⁵ OECD data refers to the period between the 3rd and fourth quarters of 2021

Actions financed by the EU have to reflect Israel's interest and capacity to implement the jointly agreed priorities and have to follow the rules set for institutional Twinning instrument on the “*acquis communautaire*”.

1.2 Twinning Sector

Health and Consumer Protection

1.3 EU funded budget

250,000 euros

1.4 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

Goal 3. Good Health and Wellbeing, in particular 3.9, reduction of illness from pollutants contamination. None of the specific indicators contained in the SDGs Handbook/Mapper tool is directly applicable to the results of the project, however the envisaged improved method of organoleptic evaluation leads to the exclusion of unsafe food from markets for human consumption and therefore reduce the consequences of unsafe food intake.

Goal 12. Responsible Consumption and Production, in particular 12.3 reduction of food waste. None of the specific indicators contained in the SDGs Handbook/Mapper tool is directly applicable to the results of the project, however the upgraded method for evaluating animal origin food and fish in particular includes also the attribution of specific non-food uses to food unsuitable for human consumption thus reducing food waste.

2. Objectives

2.1 Overall Objective

The overall objective of this intervention is to improve the safety and quality of animal origin products, in particular for imports and exports, in line with EU standards.

2.2 Specific objective

The specific objective of this action is to strengthen the capacities of the veterinary department as regards control of food of animal origin, in particular fish and fish products, with the involvement of all relevant institutions, thus strengthening the sector as a whole.

The organoleptic and sensory evaluation of food plays a significant role in the assessment of food safety and quality, and this type of evaluation is a mandatory element of physical checks listed in the Israeli legislation and in the EU Regulation on Official Controls of Food (2017/625 of 15/03/2017). Organoleptic evaluation is largely used by the veterinary department in various instances: import and export of food products, controls in markets and in processing establishments. Nevertheless, the method and procedures of this evaluation have never been formalised in written guidelines and are not legally standardised. The project will support the veterinary department (VD) in acquiring from EU partner institutions the practical knowledge to strengthen their skills and develop formal published procedures for organoleptic and sensory evaluation of food of animal origin.

This objective will be achieved by means of two main mandatory results:

- A.** The skills and knowledge of a core group of veterinarians from the veterinary department has been strengthened enough to allow them to develop draft written procedures and training materials alongside communication and training plans, which

will be presented for preliminary approval to the relevant ministries as well as for consultation to the stakeholders.

- B. The implementation of the communication and training plans will ensure the dissemination of the new procedures to all relevant actors of the sector. The feedback gathered during a pilot training period will be the basis for revision of the guidelines and training materials to final versions that will then be submitted for formal approval and publication by the relevant ministries. Thus the formal guidelines will become the basis against which the need for a possible legislative revision will be assessed.

2.3 The elements targeted in strategic documents i.e. National Development Plan/Cooperation agreement/Association Agreement/Sector reform strategy and related Action Plans

In the context of the Euro-Mediterranean Partnership, the European Union and Israel concluded an Association Agreement, which entered into force in 2000 and forms the basis for wide ranging cooperation in different fields. The main features of the EU-Israel Association Agreement include provisions on FTA in goods (and as of 2010 a substantial liberalization of trade in agricultural products); regular political dialogue; freedom of establishment and liberalization of services; the free movement of capital and competition rules; the strengthening of economic cooperation; and cooperation on social matters.

The EU – Israel Action Plan, in force since 2005, contains a description of the areas of cooperation and includes “Sanitary and phyto-sanitary issues” in its point 2.3.1:

“Sanitary and phyto-sanitary issues:

6. Improve co-operation on sanitary and phyto-sanitary matters as well as on food safety

Explore possible areas of co-operation between Israel and the European Commission in the field:

- of sanitary and phyto-sanitary issues (e.g. legislation, implementing practices), while taking into account of the different conditions prevailing on both sides
- Exchange of information on and, as appropriate, explore the possibility to increase convergence,
- of Israeli legislation with EU legislation on sanitary (live animals and animal products) and of phyto-sanitary issues (plant hygiene, plant variety and quality),
- Identify the scope for increased convergence, as appropriate, of food legislation in compliance with EU food safety principles. Exchange of views regarding foodstuff labelling requirements in order to assess the possibility of adapting Israeli legislation
- Exchange of views on the setting-up of an animal and plant identification and traceability system
- Exchange of information regarding the placing on the market of substances dangerous to human health, including plant protection products and the ensuring of monitoring of residues of these substances in live animals, animal products and plant products for food and feed”

3. Description

3.1 Background and justification

The National Food Services (NFS) is a subdivision of the Ministry of Health of Israel. The NFS deals with all aspects of food designated for human consumption, starting with setting up standards, regulations and laws that are to be implemented throughout the different districts nationwide. The NFS also regulates imported and exported food worldwide, supervises various aspects of food production, marketing, vending and in charge of food distribution nationwide. The NFS is dealing with risk management in all aspects of food consumption. The NFS is the headquarters to all inquiries regarding safe food consumption by the public or the professional employees posted in the districts and at the BIPs (Border inspections posts).

The Veterinary Department (VD) of the NFS is the competent authority regarding food of animal origin. The VD is in charge of issuing legislations, guidelines and instructions for implementation on various aspects of public health issues, regarding food of animal origin consumed by the public in Israel. Our department is in charge of all raw fish, fish products and processed meat products imported to Israel, and in accordance with the Food law 2015, is in charge of all processed food of animal origin exported from Israel worldwide. Israel does not yet export raw food of animal origin.

Role of Ministry of Agriculture in the process of food controls: supervising and regulating raising of farm animals in Israel, intended for Human consumption, and live animals import to Israel. The Department for Control of Animal Products is a parallel department to the VD in the MOH, and is in charge of import of raw meat and eggs, supervising local establishments of raw meat, poultry, fish and eggs such as – slaughterhouses, fish sorting stations and egg sorting stations.

The Israeli Food Law of 2015 (see Annex 2 for a synthetic description of its contents) has introduced in Israel a comprehensive and coherent system of official controls by public bodies in charge of public health surveillance regarding food intended for human consumption. The official controls cover vertically the whole food chain once the food products exit the primary production and are destined to processing and to marketplaces up to final consumers.

The Law spells both safety and quality criteria as well as the organisational and administrative structure of controls. There are various institutions in charge of official controls with distinct roles and with the 2015 Law also a new institution was created to implement in a coordinated action the controls executed by both Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Health, this institution is called "Ta'agid".

"Ta'agid" - The Veterinary Supervision Corporation was set up as part of a general reform of the Food Law 2015, and by the Law on Israeli veterinarians of 1991. Its main purpose is to insure competent supervision along the food chain of products of animal origin, and specifically products intended for export. The corporation is intended to serve as an executive arm of the regulators (Ministry of Health and Ministry of Agriculture) in order to have a coordinated supervision of the different steps of food production. In order to achieve its goals the Ta'agid's staff is composed of veterinarians and inspectors.

Food Laboratory controls

The Ministry of Health operates five public health laboratories. Four of them serve seven districts. The laboratories perform various analytical tests. Yet, those labs do not have sufficient experience on organoleptic checks.

The knowledge acquired in the course of the project by the core group of vet inspectors in the VD of NFS will be used to assist in guiding and training the MOH labs interested, to provide qualified and professional personnel able to perform correctly organoleptic evaluations.

Organoleptic examination is the main tool available (and identified by law) to the official veterinarian inspectors or lab technicians to evaluate the safety and quality of food of animal origin intended for human consumption. The Organoleptic checks are useful, sensitive, cost, time and effort effective tool assisting the professional supervisor to decide whether the food he is examining is safe for human consumption or not. A proper organoleptic check can also be used to evaluate the remaining safe shelf-life of the product on a basis of pre-set criterion. Over the years the art of organoleptic check in Israel was passed on informally and verbally between official veterinarians, thus limiting the results of organoleptic checks to the subjective assumption of the person examining the product. There has never been official written guidelines on a proper systematic procedure based on approved criteria for organoleptic checks.

Israel is importing fish and fish products from various countries in the EU and exporting fish, poultry and meat products, milk products and nutritional additives to several EU member states.,

Fish and fish products import to Israel sums up to approximately 100,000 tons per year, of vast variety of fish species from almost 50 countries around the world.

Currently, there are four BIPs at the borders of Israel. Two in sea ports (Haifa and Ashdod) with one veterinary inspector in each, in the Ben Gurion Airport two veterinary inspectors, working in alternate shifts and Nitzana Border Crossing— the international border between Israel and Egypt, with two veterinary inspectors, working in alternate days twice a week, but normally work also in other BIPs, so the total of veterinary inspectors at BIP's regarding fish import to Israel are only five vet-inspectors.

By the end of 2022 another two seaports will be open - in Haifa and in Ashdod. We expect it will raise the flow of total import to Israel including fish and other animal origin goods.

The current so small personnel quota has to be very skilled and efficient in their tasks.

As a baseline, Israel has adopted the frame legislation of the EU, the EU acquis is assimilated profoundly in our Health Certificates and allowing only EU approved establishments of fish, fish products and meat products to be sold in Israeli market.

Currently, Israeli MOH veterinary controls at BIPs are done for all entering consignments (100%). In fresh consignments each cargo is checked, physically, by means of organoleptic evaluation by the BIP's veterinarians at the BIP entrance to Israel. In fresh cargo of RTE (Ready to eat) products additional microbiological tests are taken to the lab. In fresh fish belonging to specific families, additional checks for histamine are sent to lab.

In frozen consignments, each cargo is checked physically and by means of organoleptic evaluation by the BIP vet and, additionally, various test labs are performed according to risk assessments.

In addition, Israel is conducting a yearly survey of contaminants and residues in the imported fish and fish products according to risk assessments.

Main differences in Israel legislation in comparison to the EU regulatory framework:

1. In Israel there is a zero tolerance to the presence of *Listeria monocytogenes* along the shelf-life for a “Ready to Eat” product.
2. 100% “Test and Hold” to all imported animal origin products.

3. Fresh fish shelf life is only 5-7 days from fishing day. For Raw frozen fish, it is up to 12 months.

The organoleptic check is the most **fundamental** check done; it is the most **potent** one to identify the beginning of deterioration in food quality.

The organoleptic check outweighs the information of all other test done, in fact even if microbiologic test is all clear, but the organoleptic check does not conform to typical freshness and safety traits of the fish/ fish product/ meat product, the given product will be rejected from entry.

The organoleptic checks are routinely carried, with practice and consultancy with colleagues and it is sufficiently satisfactory, however several improvements are necessary, in particular standardisation of methods, and written and legally bounding procedures.

Along the years, different and extra-ordinary cases have raised many questions and the need to better differentiate between unfit for human consumption and fit for human consumption but with restrictions of shelf life/ means of dispatch, retail/ wholesale/ industry.

The VD in the MOH has tried to consult with our colleagues in Europe but never had the opportunity to clarify the subjects directly with fellow colleagues.

Some of the cases raised were considered food fraud, understanding that being able to check it in a certified lab would be a powerful means to detain their entrance or their preliminary import permission.

The project includes a pilot training with a group of vet inspectors, who may eventually train other colleagues in the vast area of Public Health.

A core group of vet inspectors of NFS will perform study visits to the EU partner countries in order to be directly exposed to high standard practice in this domain and to receive practical training.

The project will also produce a dissemination/training activities and a medium-term plan to foster the adoption of the organoleptic guidelines in all BIPs and by all vet inspectors.

In relation to some issues raised in the past years it is expected that the EU partner share their knowledge and experience, regarding fish safety and quality and if possible to widen the spectrum to other animal origin raw material and products, for example regarding:

- Melanosis on fish flesh - What is the destination of the fillet once found?
- Parasites - From what extend do the presence of a certain parasite cause a rejection of the lot?
- Ulcers - From what extent is it not approved to be sold in the market?
- CO treated fillets - Is there a qualified lab test to estimate the use of this manipulation?
- Different visible signs we can detect during organoleptic checks that can indicate abuse of animal welfare especially in fresh fish, for example- hyperaemia, ulcers, hematomas, ectoparasites and more, that the EU regulations have set.
- What are the Commercial destination of salmon in reproductive stage?
- Urotropin (E-239) - means of detection.
- Detection the use of brines in production of RTE products as bactericides/ approved and forbidden chemicals

- Specific characteristics of RAW ungulates and poultry meat in the context of the organoleptic check, including the identification and differentiation of different cuts and preparations.
- According to EU standards, when is the practice of "Recondition" applied?

Proper Destinations of checked products post organoleptic evaluation

Another important aspect linked to organoleptic evaluation in food control is the classification of the checked food goods according to the destinations for which they are deemed suitable.

The organoleptic check may define the suitability according to a given ranking:

Excellent score (+++) - Retail (Export/ supermarkets)

Moderate score (++) - can be intended to further processing

Low score (+) - Intended for industrial use...will it be fit also for RTE products?

Unfit for human consumption - should be destroyed or destined to Animal feed or bio-fuel (?)

The indication of different uses as outcome of the organoleptic evaluation may thus help to maximise the usability of the relevant products and to reduce at the same time waste to be disposed and assisting sustainability.

3.2 Ongoing reforms

A. The Veterinary Division is making huge efforts to establish written guidelines for the professional vets employed in the public sector to ensure public health in all sectors wide. Among the reform efforts it is worth mentioning the adaptation of food control practices along the EU standards, in particular in recent years the following actions have been undertaken:

- 1) The Israeli uniform Health Certificate adopted the EU directives by the veterinary department for import of Fish, Fish products, Meat products, Egg products.
- 2) According to the Israeli Import guidelines, only plants listed in the list of EU establishments can be allowed to sell to Israel.
- 3) Better training for safer food (BTSF) - Courses that the MOH have participated in, before the COVID epidemic.

B. Creation of "Ta'agid" - The Veterinary Supervision Corporation

The Veterinary Supervision Corporation was set up as part of a general reform of the Israeli Food Law (2015), and by the Law on Israeli veterinarians (1991). Its main purpose is to employ veterinarians and inspectors for the purpose of legal supervision of products of animal origin. Especially products intended to export.

The corporation is intended to serve as an executive arm of the regulators (Ministry of Health and Ministry of Agriculture) in order to have a coordinated supervision of the different steps of food production.

The NFS in the MOH have adopted vast chapters of the EU regulations as the compass standards along which we act and that we intend to assimilate in our practice, the written guidelines to be developed with the present project represent a further step to approximate the EU standards.

3.3 Linked activities

The Veterinarians working in the public controls of food of animal origin have participated in many **BTSF** seminars, some of which are:

- BTSF Microbial criteria
- BTSF Training course on Audit system and internal auditing
- BTSF Controls on Contaminants and veterinary residues in feed and food.
- BTSF- HACCP
- BTSF- Fish and fishery products
- BTSF- Auditing general hygiene requirements and control procedures based on the HACCP principles developed by food business operators.

and in the following trainings:

- Codex conference - veterinary residues.
- National AMR experts in animal health sector for ECDC/EFSA ENP partner countries' workshop on Best practices on prevention and control of AMR to be implemented by TAIEX
- The Summer Academy of the German General Federal Institute for Risk Assessment

3.4 List of applicable *Union acquis/standards*

Regulation (Ec) No 854/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 29 April 2004.

This Regulation lays down specific rules for the organisation of official controls on products of animal origin.

Regulation (Eu) 2017/625 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 15 March 2017 on official controls and other official activities performed to ensure the application of food and feed law, rules on animal health and welfare, plant health and plant protection products, amending Regulations (EC) No 999/2001, (EC) No 396/2005, (EC) No 1069/2009, (EC) No 1107/2009, (EU) No 1151/2012, (EU) No 652/2014, (EU) 2016/429 and (EU) 2016/2031 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Regulations (EC) No 1/2005 and (EC) No 1099/2009 and Council Directives 98/58/EC, 1999/74/EC, 2007/43/EC, 2008/119/EC and 2008/120/EC, and repealing Regulations (EC) No 854/2004 and (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Directives 89/608/EEC, 89/662/EEC, 90/425/EEC, 91/496/EEC, 96/23/EC, 96/93/EC and 97/78/ EC and Council Decision 92/438/EEC (Official Controls Regulation).

This Regulation lays down rules for:

- (a) the performance of official controls and other official activities by the competent authorities of the Member States;
- (b) the financing of official controls;
- (c) the administrative assistance and cooperation between Member States in view of the correct application of the rules referred to in paragraph 2;
- (d) the performance of controls by the Commission in Member States and in third countries;
- (e) the adoption of conditions to be fulfilled with respect to animals and goods entering the Union from a third country;
- (f) the establishment of a computerised information system to manage information and data in relation to official controls.

This Regulation shall apply to the official controls performed for the verification of compliance with the rules, whether established at Union level or by the Member States, to apply Union legislation, in the areas of:

- (a) food and food safety, integrity and wholesomeness at any stage of production, processing and distribution of food, including rules aimed at ensuring fair practices in trade and protecting consumer interests and information, and the manufacture and use of materials and articles intended to come into contact with food;
- (b) deliberate release into the environment of Genetically Modified Organisms (GMOs) for the purpose of food and feed production;
- (c) feed and feed safety at any stage of production, processing and distribution of feed and the use of feed, including rules aimed at ensuring fair practices in trade and protecting consumer health, interests and information;
- (d) animal health requirements;
- (e) prevention and minimisation of risks to human and animal health arising from animal by-products and derived products;
- (f) welfare requirements for animals;

Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/627 of 15 March 2019 laying down uniform practical arrangements for the performance of official controls on products of animal origin intended for human consumption in accordance with Regulation (EU) 2017/625 of the European Parliament and of the Council and amending Commission Regulation (EC) No 2074/2005 as regards official controls. This Regulation lays down uniform practical arrangements for the performance of official controls and actions in relation to the production of products of animal origin intended for human consumption. These official controls and actions shall be performed by the competent authorities taking into account the requirements of Article 18(2), (3) and (5) of Regulation (EU) 2017/625 and Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/624.

Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) 2019/628 of 8 April 2019 concerning model official certificates for certain animals and goods and amending Regulation (EC) No 2074/2005 and Implementing Regulation (EU) 2016/759 as regards these model certificates. This Regulation lays down: (a) rules for the uniform application of Articles 88 and 89 of Regulation (EU) 2017/625 as regards the signature and issuance of official certificates and the guarantees of reliability for official certificates, in order to comply with the requirements of Article 126(2)(c) of that Regulation; (b) requirements for model official certificates which are not submitted in IMSOC; (c) requirements for model official certificates which are submitted in IMSOC; (d) requirements for replacement certificates. 2. This Regulation also sets out: (a) model official certificates for the entry into the Union of animals, products of animal origin, composite products, germinal products and animal by-products and notes for its completion; (b) specific model official certificates for the entry into the Union of the following animals and goods intended for human consumption and placing on the market: (i) products of animal origin for which such certificate is required in accordance with Article 13 of Delegated Regulation (EU) 2019/625; (ii) live insects; (iii) sprouts and seeds intended for the production of sprouts; (c) model official certificates in the case of ante-mortem inspection at the holding of provenance or in the case of emergency slaughter outside the slaughterhouse.

In the Israeli uniform health certificate concerning fish and fish products intended for human consumption, the below listed directives/regulations have been followed:

2006/88/EC,	Animal Health Requirements for aquaculture animals and products Prevention and control of certain dz. In aquatic animals.
853/2004	Specific hygiene rules for on the hygiene of foodstuffs
2073/2005	Microbiological criteria for foodstuffs (Text with EEA relevance)
852/2004	Hygiene of foodstuffs
2017/625	Official controls and other official activities performed to ensure the application of food and feed law, rules on animal health and <u>welfare</u> , plant health and plant protection products, amending Regulations (EC) No 999/2001, (EC) No 396/2005, (EC) No 1069/2009, (EC) No 1107/2009, (EU) No 1151/2012, (EU) No 652/2014, (EU) 2016/429 and (EU) 2016/2031 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Regulations (EC) No 1/2005 and (EC) No 1099/2009 and Council Directives 98/58/EC, 1999/74/EC, 2007/43/EC, 2008/119/EC and 2008/120/EC, and repealing Regulations (EC) No 854/2004 and (EC) No 882/2004 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Council Directives 89/608/EEC, 89/662/EEC, 90/425/EEC, 91/496/EEC, 96/23/EC, 96/93/EC and 97/78/ EC and Council Decision 92/438/EEC (Official Controls Regulation)
178/2002	General principles and requirements of food law, establishing the European Food Safety Authority and laying down procedures in matters of food safety

Other regulations that should be inserted in the upcoming updates concern:

853/2004	Bivalve toxins
1881/2006	Heavy metals
2377/90	Chemical contaminants
Codex	Glazing
10/2011	Food grade packaging
1935/2004	
2023/2006	
1169/2011	Food labelling and declaration – traceability and information to the public
1370/2013	

3.5 Components and results per component

Component 1 - Main mandatory result A

The skills and knowledge of a core group of veterinarians from the veterinary department has been strengthened enough to allow them to develop draft written procedures and training materials alongside communication and training plans, which will be presented for preliminary approval to the relevant ministries as well as for consultation to the stakeholders.

Result 1.1

A core group of vet inspectors is trained to perform Fish organoleptic evaluation according to high level standards. This will require theoretical training as well as a substantial practical exercise.

Learning the solid basis of Fish organoleptic examination from our colleagues in the EU, can be of a great importance in setting the standards and a baseline for proper organoleptic

examination nationwide. The first result is thus the familiarization with EU practices of fish organoleptic evaluation, in particular at BIPs. This will improve and refine the knowledge regarding organoleptic examination of food from animal origin (theoretical and practical knowledge and guidelines).

Moreover, a direct communication channel has opened between the Ministry of Health (MOH) in Israel and their colleagues in the European competent authorities and relevant European laboratories, establishing a channel for consultations in order to approximate the evaluation capacities of the veterinarians in Israel with colleagues in the EU.

Result 1.2

Draft guidelines with visuals aids and corresponding training materials are produced after inter-ministerial consultation and submitted for validation to the MoH and Ministry of Agriculture.

The guidelines and training material produced will be accompanied by a written training plan and a communication plan to support the dissemination of new practices to all actors in the sector.

Result 1.3

The draft guidelines developed by the core group of vet inspectors, which constitute a policy proposal for strengthening of food controls to enhance safer food production, are circulated to all public officers in charge of food controls as well as published for a stakeholders' consultation, including with the food business operators (FBO).

The draft guidelines have been approved by MoH and other associated ministries and become the "Preliminary written and visual guidelines to perform organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin", to be published on relevant ministries' official websites.

Component 2 - Main mandatory result B

The plan for dissemination and transfer of the knowledge under component 2 will build on the expertise acquired by the core group of vet inspectors under component 1, who will be trained as trainers for all public officers in charge of food controls.

Result 2.1

Relevant officials are trained to use the preliminary guidelines. The potential participants to the various forms of training are:

Ministry of Health- Main Office ~ 15 vets.

Ministry of Agriculture- Main Office ~ 15 vets.

Local authorities ~ 250 vets

Ta'agrid [of both ministries (Agriculture and Health)] ~ 220 vets.

The transfer of know-how will be done through seminars, tutoring forums and practical demonstrations, presentations to relevant personnel posted in the Border inspections posts (BIPs) and food labs, animal origin food establishments intended to export and to supply domestic food markets, Marketplaces, labs and other veterinarians in relevant governmental posts.

Result 2.2

Building on the feedback from the trial period of trainings, the preliminary guidelines are edited into the final guidelines with visual aids for organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin.

Those final guidelines will constitute the basis of the dissemination of the new skills and practices to all vet inspectors and actors in the sector.

This formal written guidelines will support the ensuing assessment of the need for a revision of the legislative framework.

3.6 Expected activities

For each one of the results described above shall correspond the description of the relevant activity(ies). The description of the activities within each Component is ordered according to a logical time sequence.

Component 1

Result 1.1

A core group of vet inspectors is trained to perform organoleptic evaluation according to high level standards and to act as trainers to other veterinarians.

Activity 1.1.1

Activity 1.1.1	A core group of vet inspectors currently involved in organoleptic and sensory evaluation is trained to acquire additional knowledge from EU partners.
Time Schedule	Q1
Subject	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Two 3 day trainings• 2 study visits of 5 days each
Methods	Trainings
Resources	MS: 1 short-term expert (STE) BC: Project Leader
Duration	5 working days for STE for each one of the two training sessions 5 working days x 2 in EU countries for Israeli project team (6/8) during study visits
Output	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Activity report detailing the implementation of the trainings• Training materials and aids
Indicators of Achievement	I1.1 The core group of vet inspectors better their understanding of organoleptic controls in line with EU standards

Detailed description: two 3-day trainings will be carried out covering the following steps:

- a. Israeli colleagues will show how the Fish organoleptic and sensory evaluation is currently carried out in different contexts: BIPs, processing establishments, marketplaces
- b. EU partner experts will provide an overview of methodologies used in more than 1 MS, delivering also relevant information and documentation. The topics will include also the aspect of adoption of national guidelines into the regulatory framework, outlining differences among MSs
- c. The training will be carried out also by means of practical demonstrations and case studies, visits to marketplaces and warehouses, BIPs and processing establishments
- d. The EU partner experts will discuss with Israeli colleagues' special issues about fish and fish products of particular relevance in the local context such as:

Melanosis on fish flesh, Detection of Parasites, Ulcers, CO treated fillets and other emerging problems as listed above in point 3.1.

Each 3-day training will be carried out within a week (5 w/days), where the first day is devoted to preparatory activity, then the 3 day trainings and the last day for reporting. The training of

the core group of vet inspectors will also include methods for passing over their knowledge to other veterinarians operating in the public sector of food controls.

Activity 1.1.2

Activity 1.1.2	Two 5-day study visits will be organised in 2 different EU MS
Time Schedule	Q1
Subject	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 study visits of 5 days each are carried out in 2 different EU MS(s)
Methods	Trainings by means of practical exposure to food control methods in EU
Resources	MS: EU officers who host participant Israeli project team BC: Members of the Israeli project team visiting EU institutions
Duration	5 working days x 2 in EU countries for Israeli project team (6/8) during study visits
Output	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity report detailing the implementation of the visits • Training materials and aids
Indicators of Achievement	I1.1 The core group of vet inspectors have acquired first-hand experience of different practices of organoleptic checks in line with EU standards

Two study visits to experience different EU practices will help to consolidate the result of the training.

Two 5-day study visits will be organised in 2 EU MS to expose Israeli officials to different EU practices and to consolidate the knowledge acquired in the trainings. The Israeli project team will be exposed to:

- how official controls are organised in the host MSs,
- the participants will be directly involved in the practice of Fish organoleptic evaluation during physical checks at BIPs,
- specific visits will be devoted to show on the spot how Fish organoleptic and sensory evaluation is carried out in processing establishments and in marketplaces.
- visit to laboratories for food examination

Result 1.2

Draft guidelines are disseminated among a core group of vet inspectors and public officers. Comments and suggestions regarding the draft guidelines are gathered during meetings and exchanges with inspectors and are used to define the final version of the preliminary guidelines.

Activity 1.2

Activity 1.2.	Dissemination of draft guidelines among vet inspectors and selected public officers in charge of food controls.
Time Schedule	Q2
Subject	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • seminars held with vet inspectors and public officers on draft guidelines on organoleptic evaluation. • Comments and suggestions are gathered during meetings and exchanges with inspectors and are used to define the final version of the guidelines
Methods	Seminars and workshops
Resources	MS: STEs and PL BC: whole project team
Duration	Over the time span of 1 month at the beginning of Q2

Output	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity report detailing the implementation of the seminars • Training materials and aids
Indicators of Achievement	I1.2 A core group of veterinarians of inspection services has been consulted on the drafting of draft preliminary guidelines and training materials ready to be submitted for approval to the relevant ministries

After the completion of the training and of the study visits, the experts of NFS who take part in the project will be working with EU partner experts in preparation of the draft guidelines for organoleptic evaluation as well as on the production of training materials. The draft guidelines and draft training materials will be made available to all vet inspectors and selected public officers in charge of food controls. The diffusion of these materials will include also some meetings and discussion to gather comments and suggestions about the proposed draft guidelines. The outcome of these interactions with colleagues will help in the finalization of the draft guidelines before approval by the relevant ministries

Result 1.3

Activity 1.3

Activity 1.3	Drafting of training and communication plans
Time Schedule	Q2
Subject	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public sector-wide consultation • Training plans for trainers • Capacity building of trainers • Plan for effective dissemination
Methods	Seminars and workshops
Resources	MS: STEs and PL BC: whole project team
Duration	Over the time span of 1 month in the last part of Q2
Output	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activity report detailing the implementation of seminars and workshops • Training materials and aids
Indicators of Achievement	I1.3 Draft guidelines and training materials are ready to be disseminated and to be tested through a period of trial trainings.

The written preliminary guidelines for organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin will be published for stakeholders' consultation and the project team will then plan how these guidelines will be used for training of relevant actors and disseminated throughout the whole sector. The need for a later inclusion of the written guidelines in the regulatory framework will be evaluated in the course of the project. The diffusion of the guidelines will take place through the use of different media, seminars, meetings, practical demonstrations, web site, etc... The project team will organize one or two events depending on time available.

Component 2

Formal written guidelines and training materials are published for sector-wide dissemination and can be used as basis for possible legislative revision.

Result 2.1

The draft written guidelines, training material and visual aids are tested in the various training setups.

Activity 2.1

Activity 2.1.	Dissemination of preliminary guidelines and training of all relevant personnel of both ministries, Ta'agid and labs
Time Schedule	Q1
Subject	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Training sessions • Monitoring of trainings outputs • Dissemination of preliminary guidelines
Methods	Joint team work
Resources	MS: STEs and PL BC: whole project team
Duration	Over a period of two months in the second part of Q1
Output	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft written guidelines of organoleptic evaluation • Visual aids and tutorials to accompany the guidelines
Indicators of Achievement	I2.1 An agreed number of the 500 identified officials is trained in the use of the preliminary guidelines

After a pilot training period the project team will prepare the final written guidelines on how to carry out organoleptic and sensory evaluation. Since this type of evaluation is chiefly practical the guidelines will include also visual aids to demonstrate methods and procedures.

Carried out by means of joint work on site of Project Team = EU experts + NFS colleagues

Result 2.2

Publication of the final version of the official guidelines for organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin and of validated training materials.

Activity 2.2

Activity 2.2	Preparation of the final version of the guidelines with visual aids and training materials
Time Schedule	Q2
Subject	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Analysis of monitoring of pilot trainings • Monitoring of dissemination strategy • The project team prepares in joint work sessions the final guidelines
Methods	Joint team work
Resources	MS: STEs and PL BC: whole project team
Duration	Over a period of 1 month in Q2
Output	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Final written guidelines of organoleptic evaluation • Visual aids and tutorials to accompany the guidelines
Indicators of Achievement	I2.2 Final guidelines are adopted and published in a format ready to feed into an ensuing revision of the relevant regulatory framework

The final formal written guidelines (including visual aids) and a final set of training material are published. The final version of the guidelines will be done in a format compatible with adoption in the regulatory framework as a legally binding standard.

Carried out by means of joint work on site of Project Team = EU experts + NFS colleagues

Timing of project activities:

Activities	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Month 7	Month 8
1.1.1 training core team								
1.1.2 study visits								
1.2 seminars for public officers								
1.3 dissemination events								
2.1 preparation draft guidelines								
2.2 preparation final guidelines								

3.7 Means/input from the EU Member State Partner Administration:

3.7.1 Profile and tasks of the PL

The Project Leader will be based in the Member State and will be responsible for the overall management of the project and the coordination of activities performed, ensuring the overall quality of the services provided on site. He/she will have the overall responsibility for the implementation of all Twinning activities.

Profile of the Project Leader

Requirements:

- University degree in relevant agricultural, veterinary and biological sciences or equivalent professional experience of 8 years;
- A minimum of 3 years of relevant professional experience in an EU MS administration/assimilated dealing with relevant issues related to implementation of food safety, veterinary and phytosanitary policy;
- Proven experience in development of legislation aligned with EU acquis on food safety and veterinary issues;
- Sound knowledge of EU regulatory framework on food safety, veterinary and phytosanitary sectors;
- Previous experience with Twining and/or TAIEX instruments;
- Well-developed professional skills in policy advancement, strategic planning, managing resources and budget;
- Good leadership, communication and interpersonal skills;
- Working knowledge of written and spoken English.

Assets:

- Experience in international cooperation projects in neighbouring and/or candidate countries as regards alignment about fish and other animal products safety would be an asset

Tasks:

- Directing, coordinating and monitoring Twinning project performance;

- Leading operational dialogue, supporting advocacy of the Twinning project at political level;
- Ensuring implementation of project activities and achievement of expected results;
- Producing progress reports as required by the Twinning Contract;
- Co-Chairing project steering committees;
- Provision of legal and technical advice and analysis whenever needed.

3.7.2. Profile and tasks of other short-term experts

The Twinning light proposal should include a pool of short-term experts to ensure smooth implementation of the action in line with the proposed work plan. Short-term experts will advise the beneficiary administration on the methodologies that are most compatible with their needs and the objective of the action.

The Twinning Contract will elaborate as to the precise number, tasks and working days of short-term experts.

The proposed pool of short-term experts should cover the following range of experience on food safety controls: in BIPs, in processing establishments, marketplaces, warehouses and work in the food safety police.

The general profile of the short-term experts' pool should include the following profiles and expertise:

- University degree in agricultural, veterinary or biological sciences or equivalent professional experience of 8 years;
- At least 3 years of relevant professional experience in a Member State's public administration or mandated body covering, at least one of the following areas of expertise: food safety controls in BIPs, processing establishments, marketplaces, warehouses, food safety police;
- At least 3 years of relevant profession experience in communication campaigns;
- Sound ability to teach and advise;
- Proven experience on the relevant EU regulatory framework and/or experience in relevant EU MS administration;
- Working knowledge of written and spoken English.
- Assets: Food inspection experience related to fish and fish products

4. Budget

Maximum budget available for the grant: Euro 250.000,00

5. Implementation Arrangements

5.1 Implementing Agency responsible for tendering, contracting and accounting (AO/CFCE/PAO/European Union Delegation/Office)

The Implementing Agency which will be responsible for the tendering, contracting, and accounting of this Twinning project is the Delegation of the European Union to the State of Israel. The contact person is:

Estelle Kadouch

Operations Section

Institutional Building Instruments (Twinning and TAIEX)

Delegation of the EU to the State of Israel

Address: 5-7 Shoham St, Ramat Gan, Israel

Postal Address: P.O. Box 3513, Ramat Gan, 52136, Israel

Email: Estelle.KADOUCH@eeas.europa.eu

5.2 Institutional framework

The Beneficiary institution is the Israeli Ministry of Health, and more specifically, its subdivision: the National Food Services (NFS).

The NFS deals with all aspects of food designated for human consumption, starting with setting up standards, regulations and laws that are to be implemented throughout the different districts nationwide. The NFS also regulates imported and exported food worldwide, supervises various aspects of food production, marketing, vending and in charge of food distribution nationwide. The NFS is dealing with risk management in all aspects of food consumption. The NFS is the headquarters to all inquiries regarding safe food consumption by the public or the professional employees posted in the districts and at the BIPs (Border inspections posts).

The Veterinary Department (VD) in the NSF is the competent authority regarding food of animal origin. The VD is in charge of issuing legislations, guidelines and instructions for implementation on various aspects of public health issues, regarding food of animal origin consumed by the public in Israel. The veterinary department is in charge of all fish and fish products imported to Israel, and in accordance with the Food law 2015, is in charge of all processed food of animal origin exported from Israel worldwide.

Additional beneficiary institutions are the Israeli Ministry of Agriculture and the “Ta’agid” – the Veterinary Supervision Cooperation.

The Ministry of Agriculture is involved in the process of food controls through its Department for Control of Animal Products, which is part of the Veterinary Services and Animal Health division. The Department for Control of Animal Products is a parallel department to the VD in the ministry of health, and is in charge of raw meat and eggs, local establishments of raw meat, poultry, fish and eggs such as – slaughterhouses, fish sorting stations, egg sorting stations, etc.

The “Ta’agid”, the Veterinary Supervision Corporation, was set up as part of the general reform of food legislation undertaken in 2015. The Public Health Protection (Food) Law of 2015 foresees the creation of a government corporation that would be responsible for the veterinary supervision of the entire food production chain under the responsibility of the Ministry of Agriculture and of the Ministry of Health. The composition of the corporation, its objectives and all the conditions for its establishment and activity are set forth in the Veterinary Physicians Law - 1991, which has been updated accordingly. Its

main purpose is to employ veterinarians and inspectors for the purpose of legal supervision of products of animal origin; especially products intended for export. The corporation serves as an executive arm of the regulators (Ministry of Health and Ministry of Agriculture) in order to have a coordinated supervision of the different steps of food production.

5.3 Counterparts in the Beneficiary administration

5.3.1 Contact person

Dr. Rina Ramrazker, MVPH., DVM., M.Agro., B.Sci.
Food Control Services
Ministry of Health,
P.O.Box 2301 Tel Aviv 61203
Tel.:+ 972-50-6242309
Rina.ramrazker@moh.gov.il

5.3.2 PL counterpart

Dr. Rina Ramrazker, MVPH., DVM., M.Agro., B.Sci.
Food Control Services
Ministry of Health,
P.O.Box 2301 Tel Aviv 61203
Tel.:+ 972-50-6242309
Rina.ramrazker@moh.gov.il

6. Duration of the project

8 months

7. Sustainability

The results achieved by this intervention will form the basis of an effective operational enhancement of the public food control system that will improve food safety in Israel while also facilitating trade integration with the EU.

The results of the two components of the project will deliver as immediate outputs:

- A core group of vet inspectors qualified to perform organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin;
- Written guidelines, endowed also with visual aids, for organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin.

The project is structured to ensure medium and long-term sustainability of those outputs by:

- Setting up mechanisms to transfer knowledge acquired by the core group of vet inspectors to veterinarians throughout the respective organizational structure of the Beneficiary administrations involved;
- Disseminating the guidelines produced to all relevant internal and external stakeholders.

Furthermore, as standards regarding export of processed food of animal origin is yet to be established, the expertise acquired through this intervention will contribute to building a well-based foundation for manufacturing and marketing safer food.

Thus, it is anticipated that the outcomes of this intervention will generate long term impact to the beneficiary.

8. Crosscutting issues

The EU recently updated its 2014 Toolbox on the rights-based approach (RBA) thus renewing its commitment to adopt a human rights-based approach (HRBA)⁶ in all its external action. This conceptual approach is directed towards strengthening the capacity of rights holders to claim their rights. All Twinning light applications must be designed integrating a HRBA, including gender equality mainstreaming, and must clearly identify the national and international legal basis around which a proposal has been developed⁷.

The Twinning project will have to report against relevant quantitative and qualitative indicators.

Equal opportunity

Based on the fundamental principles of promoting equality and combating discrimination, participation in the project will be guaranteed on the basis of equal access, regardless of sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation.

Environmental considerations

No adverse environmental effects are foreseeable from this project. In addition, the effect of the project will create environmental benefits in the long term. Indeed, an important aspect linked to organoleptic evaluation in food control is the classification of the checked food goods according to the uses and destinations for which they are deemed suitable. The indication of different uses resulting from organoleptic evaluations may thus contribute to maximising the usability of the relevant products while reducing the amount of waste to be disposed of. For instance, some products discarded as unfit for human consumption may be processed to fuel, pharmaceutical products and other non-food products, therefore the selection for different purposes may reduce waste to be disposed of, and allow for energy recovery.

9. Conditionality and sequencing

There are neither special factors nor external conditions pre-required to the launching of the project.

The stakeholders' involvement will take place during the project's implementation, once the guidelines are defined.

10. Indicators for performance measurement

Component 1

The capacities of VD are strengthened as regards control of food of animal origin, with the involvement of relevant institutions and the sector as a whole.

Result 1.1

A core group of vet inspectors is trained to perform fresh food organoleptic evaluation according to high level EU standards. This will require theoretical training as well as a substantial practical exercise.

⁶ Human rights based approach toolbox available [here](#).

⁷ For guidance, consult the "[Human Rights Guide to the Sustainable Development Goals](#)".

Indicators for Result 1.1:

Indicator 1.1:

Baseline: the core group of 5 vet inspectors have only an empirical ability of executing organoleptic evaluation

Target: the core group of 5 vet inspectors are trained as organoleptic evaluators

Result 1.2

Draft guidelines are disseminated among vet inspectors and selected officials. Comments and suggestions regarding the draft guidelines are gathered during meetings and exchanges with inspectors and stakeholders. Comments and suggestions are then used to define the final version of the preliminary guidelines.

Indicators for Result 1.2:

Baseline: no Israeli written formal procedures available for organoleptic checks for food of animal origin

Target: Preliminary guidelines with visual aids and training materials are submitted to ministries for approval.

Result 1.3

A training plan for all relevant officials as well as a communication plan for sector-wide dissemination are produced.

Indicators for Result 1.3:

Baseline: No basis for dissemination of systematic knowledge of organoleptic checks among stakeholders and relevant personnel.

Target: training plan of a relevant personnel and dissemination plan submitted to the ministries for approval.

Component 2

The published preliminary guidelines and corresponding training material are tested during a pilot training phase, and disseminated sector-wide.

Result 2.1

A core group of vet inspectors start training relevant personnel on organoleptic checks.

Indicators for Result 2.1:

Baseline: no training available for relevant officials in the sector.

Target: an agreed number of relevant personnel benefit from training on organoleptic checks during the pilot phase.

Result 2.2

Delivery of the final version of revised guidelines and visual aids for organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin in a format compliant with a possible need for revision of regulatory framework.

Indicators for Result 2.2:

Baseline: veterinarians of inspection service and labs do not have formal procedures for performing organoleptic evaluation.

Target: all veterinarians of inspection services and labs have access to official documentation on professional organoleptic evaluation.

11. Facilities available

The beneficiary will provide the following facilities to the project team:

1. Office space equipped with computer and internet for at least 3 people working at the same time.
2. Conference room in our offices in Tel Aviv, Ashdod.
3. Class rooms in a MOH learning center.
4. Labs available for meeting and practicing.

Open access to BIPs in: Ashdod, Haifa, Ben- Gurion Airport.

Whenever translation and/or interpretation services might be necessary for the implementation of activities (for instance translation of guidelines, etc.), such costs will be budgeted under the relevant budget heading (see Section 6.2.8 of the Twinning Manual).

ANNEXES TO PROJECT FICHE

Annex 1. Simplified Logical Framework

Annex 2. Synthesis of Israeli Food Law (2015)

Annex 1: Simplified Logical Framework

	Description	Indicators (with relevant baseline and target data)	Sources of verification	Risks	Assumptions (external to project)
Overall Objective	Fish and other animal origin products' safety and quality have improved, in particular for imported and exported food of animal origin, in line with EU standards.	Controls at BIPs, in marketplaces and establishments more accurate and effective, resulting in lower number of non-compliant food shipments.	Vet inspection annual reports	Slow pace in implementation of improvements Outbreak of new parasites	Strong political priority to food safety No major outbreak of new parasites
Specific (Project) Objective(s)	<p>The capacities of VD are strengthened as regards control of food of animal origin, with the involvement of relevant institutions and the sector as a whole.</p> <p>This objective will be achieved by means of two main mandatory results:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Skills and knowledge of the counterpart veterinarians has improved B. Written and visual guideline to perform organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin have been published and legally adopted 	<p>5 vet inspectors are certified as expert in organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin.</p> <p>Number and programmes of dissemination seminars</p> <p>Guidelines in written and visual media are published and formally adopted in the appropriate legal framework</p> <p><u>Baseline:</u> to be established at the beginning of implementation</p> <p>Target: to be defined in coordination with implementing EU Member State</p>	Individual certifications Reports of seminars and study visits Final project report Delivered written guidelines and visual media	Very low risk: 5 vet inspectors not fully available Delays in formal adoption of guidelines in the appropriate legal framework	Core group of 5 vet inspectors available to be trained as trainers MOH confirms commitment to formally adopt guidelines produced by the project

	Description	Indicators (with relevant baseline and target data)	Sources of verification	Risks	Assumptions (external to project)
Mandatory results/outputs by components	COMPONENT 1 Result 1.1 A core group of 5 vet inspectors are trained in performing fish organoleptic evaluation and to act as trainers to other veterinarians.	<u>Baseline</u> : the core group of 5 vet inspectors have only an empirical ability of executing organoleptic evaluation <u>Target</u> : the core group of 5 vet inspectors are trained as organoleptic evaluators after training and study visits	Project interim report Final project report, individual certifications	Very low risk: 5 vet inspectors not fully available	Core group of 5 vet inspectors available to be trained as trainers
	Result 1.2 Draft guidelines with visuals aids and corresponding training materials are produced after inter-ministerial consultation and submitted for validation to the MoH and Ministry of Agriculture.	<u>Baseline</u> : veterinarians of inspection services and labs do not have formal procedures for organoleptic evaluation <u>Target</u> : Preliminary guidelines with visual aids and training materials are submitted to ministries for approval.	Interviews to relevant veterinarians Project reports	Low risk: veterinarians of inspection service and labs not fully available	MOH committed to let veterinarians of inspection service and of labs take part in the seminars and demonstrations; MOH makes available venues and tools for seminars and practical demonstrations
	Result 1.3 A training plan for all relevant officials as well as a communication plan for sector-wide dissemination are produced.	<u>Baseline</u> : No basis for dissemination of systematic knowledge of organoleptic checks among stakeholders and relevant personnel. <u>Target</u> : training plan of a relevant personnel and dissemination plan submitted to the ministries for approval.	Project reports	Limited availability of veterinarians of inspection service and of labs to take part in the seminars and demonstrations Lack of support to provide tools for visual aids	MOH committed to let veterinarians of inspection service and of labs take part in the seminars and demonstrations; MOH makes available venues and tools for seminars and practical demonstrations

	Description	Indicators (with relevant baseline and target data)	Sources of verification	Risks	Assumptions (external to project)
Mandatory results/ outputs by components	COMPONENT 2 Final formal guidelines to perform organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin have been published and ready to be adopted in the appropriate legal framework. Result 2.1 The draft written guidelines, training material and visual aids are tested in the various training setups.	 <u>Baseline</u> : no training available for relevant officials in the sector. <u>Target</u> : an agreed number of relevant personnel benefit from training on organoleptic checks during the pilot phase.	Project reports Monitoring system of training plan Delivered documents	Lack of support to provide tools for visual aids	Continued commitment of MOH to support publication of guidelines Active participation of NFS project team
	Result 2.2 Delivery of the final version of revised guidelines and visual aids for organoleptic evaluation of food of animal origin in a format compliant with a possible need for revision of regulatory framework.	 <u>Baseline</u> : veterinarians of inspection service and labs do not have formal procedures for performing organoleptic evaluation. <u>Target</u> : all veterinarians of inspection services and labs have access to official documentation on professional organoleptic evaluation.	Project reports Monitoring of communication plan Formally published documents and visual aids	Delays in formal adoption of guidelines in the appropriate legal framework	Continued commitment of MOH to support publication of guidelines Active participation of NFS project team

	Description	Means	Resources	Assumptions
Activities	<p>Component 1</p> <p>Result 1.1</p> <p>Activity 1.1.1</p> <p>A core group of vet inspectors currently involved in organoleptic and sensory evaluation is trained to acquire additional knowledge from EU partners.</p> <p>Two 3 day trainings will be carried out.</p> <p>Each 3 day training will be carried out within a week (5 w/days), where the first day is devoted to preparatory activity, then the 3 day trainings and the last day for reporting.</p>	<p>Israeli experts, in particular BC PL, core group of 5 vet inspectors.</p> <p>EU experts from partner institutions.</p> <p>Training venues and communication tools, including visits to local inspection sites</p>	<p>To be defined in the budget of the Twinning proposal by the applicant institutions</p>	<p>Core group of 5 Israeli vet inspectors to be trained as trainers available.</p> <p>Beneficiary makes available training venues, communication tools and, when needed, onsite visits to inspection sites</p>
	<p>Activity 1.1.2</p> <p>Study visits</p> <p>Two 5 day study visits will be organised in 2 EU MS as part of the training of the core group of 5 vet inspectors..</p>	<p>Israeli experts, in particular BC PL, core group of 5 vet inspectors.</p> <p>EU experts from partner institutions.</p> <p>Travel and stay in EU destinations for participants</p>	<p>To be defined in the budget of the Twinning proposal by the applicant institutions</p>	<p>Core group of 5 Israeli vet inspectors available and enabled to travel to EU destinations</p>

	Description	Means	Resources	Assumptions
	<p>Result 1.2</p> <p>Activity 1.2</p> <p>Dissemination of draft guidelines among vet inspectors and selected public officers in charge of food controls.</p>	<p>Israeli experts, in particular BC PL, core group of 5 vet inspectors.</p> <p>EU experts from partner institutions.</p> <p>Training venues and communication tools adequate to number of participants.</p> <p>Interpretation and translation.</p>	<p>To be defined in the budget of the Twinning proposal by the applicant institutions</p>	<p>Beneficiary makes available training and conference venues and communication tools, and takes care of invitations for relevant participants</p>
	<p>Result 1.3</p> <p>Activity 1.3</p> <p>Drafting of training and communication plans</p>	<p>Israeli experts, in particular BC PL, core group of 5 vet inspectors. EU experts from partner institutions.</p> <p>Training venues and communication tools adequate to number of participants.</p> <p>Interpretation and translation</p>	<p>To be defined in the budget of the Twinning proposal by the applicant institutions</p>	<p>Beneficiary makes available training and conference venues and communication tools, and takes care of invitations for relevant participants.</p> <p>Beneficiary allows web publication of guidelines, including visual aids</p>

	Description	Means	Resources	Assumptions
	<p>Component 2</p> <p>Result 2.1</p> <p>Activity 2.1</p> <p>Implementation of training plan and communication plan during pilot phase.</p> <p>Carried out by means of joint work on site of Project Team = EU experts + NFS colleagues</p>	<p>Israeli experts, in particular BC PL, core group of 5 vet inspectors. EU experts from partner institutions.</p> <p>Contracted web and media development</p> <p>Monitoring mechanisms</p>	<p>To be defined in the budget of the Twinning proposal by the applicant institutions</p>	<p>Core group of 5 Israeli vet inspectors available to participate in the work of the joint project team</p>
	<p>Result 2.2</p> <p>Preparation of the final version of the guidelines with visual aids in a format compatible with possible adoption in the regulatory framework.</p> <p>Carried out by means of joint work on site of Project Team = EU experts + NFS colleagues</p>	<p>Israeli experts, in particular BC PL, core group of 5 vet inspectors. EU experts from partner institutions.</p> <p>Contracted web and media development</p> <p>Monitoring mechanisms</p>	<p>To be defined in the budget of the Twinning proposal by the applicant institutions</p>	<p>Core group of 5 Israeli vet inspectors available to participate in the work of the joint project team</p>

Annex 2: Synthesis of Consumer health protection Law (Food) – 2015

(also known as the Israeli Food Law – 2015)

Chapter I - Scope and Definitions

Chapter II - Ensuring the Health and Quality of Food

Chapter III – Food Production Regulation

Chapter IV – Food Import Regulation

Chapter IVa - Food intended for export only

Chapter V – Food Marketing Regulation

Chapter VI – Transport and Storage of Food Temperature-controlled transport

Chapter VII – General Provisions Regarding Manufacturer, Importer and Marketer

Chapter VIII – Veterinary Inspection Regulation

Chapter IX - Powers of Supervision and Enforcement

Chapter X – Penalties

Aim and scope –

- (i) Regulate the responsibility of the food producer and importer, the supervision of food production and importation, in order to ensure that the food is provided is at an adequate level of quality, health and safety, including adequate production conditions, conforming to the standards set forth in food legislation;
- (ii) Regulate the responsibility of the food marketer and his duties at every stage from the transfer of food from the time of production, through its import to the place of sale directly to the consumer and monitor their existence, all to ensure that the food sold is produced by an authorized person, and if imported - That the food is marketed at an adequate level of quality, health and safety that meets the criteria set out in the food legislation;
- (iii) Establish criteria for the quality, health and safety of food in Israel, in accordance with what is accepted in the regulations in developed countries, including accepted international standards and supervision based on risk management for the implementation of the principles of arrangements as set forth in this Law;

Moreover specific to this project:

On section 66 in the Israeli food law (2015):

Preliminary demands – food import permit: While issuing the food permit, The professional governmental inspector or vet, will set the lab tests needed for the specific product upon arrival at the quarantine station in Israel. Nevertheless, an organoleptic test will be performed. "Organoleptic test" - a test of smell, appearance, texture and taste.